arXiv:1003.5349v1 [math.NA] 28 Mar 2010

On the optimality of Orthogonal Greedy Algorithm for M-coherent dictionaries.[1]

Eugene Livshitz

Abstract

We show that Orthogonal Greedy Algorithms (Orthogonal Matching Pursuit) provides almost optimal approximation on the first $[1/(20M)]$ steps for M-coherent dictionaries.

1 Introduction.

In this article we continue the research of convergence of greedy algorithms with regards to dictionaries with small coherence (see [3], [4], [7], [1], [2], [6], [5]). The study of approximation by incoherent dictionaries was mainly motivated by applications to compressed sensing. In [3], [7], [1] it was shown that Orthogonal Greedy Algorithm (Orthogonal Matching Pursuit) is effective for signal recovering. In this article we discuss this problem from the point of view of Approximation Theory.

Let us recall standard definition of Greedy Algorithms theory. We say that a set $\mathcal{D}$ from a Hilbert space H is a dictionary if

$$\phi \in \mathcal{D} \ \Rightarrow \|\phi\| = 1, \text{ and } \overline{\operatorname{span}}\mathcal{D} = H.$$

We study dictionaries with small values of coherence

$$M := \sup_{\phi,\psi\in\mathcal{D},\ \phi\neq\psi} |\langle \phi, \psi\rangle|. \tag{1}$$

Dictionaries with coherence M are called M-coherent.

Orthogonal Greedy Algorithm (OGA) *Set* $f_0 := f \in H$, $G_0^{OGA}(f,\mathcal{D}) := 0$. *For each* $m \geq 0$ *we inductively find* $g_{m+1} \in \mathcal{D}$ *such that*

$$|\langle f_m, g_{m+1}\rangle| = \sup_{g\in\mathcal{D}} |\langle f_m, g\rangle|$$

and define

$$G_{m+1}^{OGA}(f,\mathcal{D}) := \operatorname{Proj}_{\operatorname{span}(g_1,\dots,g_{m+1})}(f),$$

$$f_{m+1} := f - G_{m+1}^{OGA}(f,\mathcal{D}).$$

For a function $f \in H$ we define its best m-term approximation

$$\sigma_m(f) := \sigma_m(f,\mathcal{D}) := \inf_{c_i\in\mathbb{R},\phi_i\in\mathcal{D},1\leq i\leq m} \|f - \sum_{i=1}^{m} c_i\phi_i\|.$$

Following V.N. Temlyakov we call inequalities connecting the error of Greedy approximation and the best m-term approximation *Lebesgue type inequalities.*

---

[1] This research is partially supported by Russian Foundation for Basic Research project 08-01-00799 and 09-01-12173

The first Lebesgue type inequality for Greedy Algorithms was obtained by A.C. Gilbert, M. Muthukrishnan and J. Strauss in [3]

Theorem A. *For every M-coherent dictionary $\mathcal{D}$ and any function $f \in H$ the inequality*

$$\|f - G_m^{OGA}(f, \mathcal{D})\| = \|f_m\| \le 8m^{1/2}\sigma_m(f)$$

holds for all m,

$$1 \le m \le \frac{1}{8\sqrt{2}M} - 1.$$

This estimate was improved by J. Tropp [7] (see also paper [1] of D. L. Donoho, M. Elad and V.N. Temlyakov.)

Theorem B. *For every M-coherent dictionary $\mathcal{D}$ and any function $f \in H$*

$$\|f_m\| \le (1+6m)^{1/2}\sigma_m(f), \text{ if } 1 \le m \le \frac{1}{3M}.$$

D. L. Donoho, M. Elad and V.N. Temlyakov [2] dramatically improved factor in front of σ.

Theorem C. *For every M-coherent dictionary $\mathcal{D}$ and any function $f \in H$*

$$\|f_{\lfloor m\log m\rfloor}\| \le 24\sigma_m(f), \text{ if } 1 \le m \le \frac{1}{20M^{2/3}}.$$

V.N. Temlyakov and P. Zheltov [6] improved the upper border for m and proved two new Lebesgue type inequalities.

Theorem D. *For every M-coherent dictionary $\mathcal{D}$ and any function $f \in H$*

$$\|f_{m\lfloor 2^{\sqrt{\log m}}\rfloor}\| \le 3\sigma_m(f), \text{ if } m2^{\sqrt{2\log m}} \le \frac{1}{26M}.$$

Theorem E. *For every M-coherent dictionary $\mathcal{D}$, any function $f \in H$ and any fixed $\delta > 0$*

$$\|f_{m2^{\lceil\frac{1}{\delta}\rceil}}\| \le 3\sigma_m(f), \text{ if } m \le \left(\frac{1}{14M}\right)^{\frac{1}{1+\delta}} 2^{-\lceil\frac{1}{\delta}\rceil}.$$

The aim of this article is to prove the following result.

Theorem 1. *For every M-coherent dictionary $\mathcal{D}$ and any function $f \in H$ we have*

$$\|f - G_{2m}^{OGA}(f, \mathcal{D})\| = \|f_{2m}\| \le 3\sigma_m(f)$$

for all

$$1 \le m \le \frac{1}{20M}.$$

2 Preliminary lemmas.

By conditions of Theorem 1 we have

$$M \le mM \le 1/20. \tag{2}$$

We use several standard lemmas.

Lemma 1. *For any n, $1 \le n \le 2m$, and*

$$h = \sum_{i=1}^{n} c_i \phi_i, \ \ c_i \in \mathbb{R}, \phi_i \in \mathcal{D},$$

we have

$$\max_{1\le i\le n} |\langle h, \phi_i\rangle| \le \max_{1\le i\le n} |c_i|(1+2mM), \tag{3}$$

$$\max_{1\le i\le n} |\langle h, \phi_i\rangle| \ge \max_{1\le i\le n} |c_i|(1-2mM), \tag{4}$$

$$\max_{1\le i\le n} |c_i| \le \max_{1\le i\le n} |\langle h, \phi_i\rangle|(1+3mM), \tag{5}$$

Proof. Using (1) we have for any $1 \le i \le n$

$$\langle h, \phi_i\rangle = \langle c_i\phi_i, \phi_i\rangle + \langle \sum_{1\le j\le n,\ i\ne j} c_j\phi_j, \phi_i\rangle \le$$

$$\le c_i + (n-1)\left(\max_{1\le i\le n} |c_i|\right) M \le c_i + \left(\max_{1\le i\le n} |c_i|\right) 2mM.$$

Similarly

$$\langle h, \phi_i\rangle \ge c_i - \left(\max_{1\le i\le n} |c_i|\right) 2mM.$$

The last two inequalities imply (3) and (4). It follow form (2) that

$$(1-2mM)(1+3mM) = 1 + mM - 6(mM)^2 \ge 1 + mM(1-0.3) \ge 1.$$

To prove (5) we estimate

$$\max_{1\le i\le n} |c_i| \le \max_{1\le i\le n} |\langle h, \phi_i\rangle|(1-2mM)^{-1} \le \max_{1\le i\le n} |\langle h, \phi_i\rangle|(1+3mM).$$

□

As corollary we obtain

Lemma 2. *Let $n \le 2m$, $h \in H$, $\phi_i \in \mathcal{D}$, $1 \le i \le n$. Suppose that*

$$\mathrm{Proj}_{\mathrm{span}(\phi_1,\ldots,\phi_n)}(h) = \sum_{i=1}^{n} c_i\phi_i.$$

Then

$$\max_{1\le i\le n} |c_i| \le \max_{1\le i\le n} |\langle h, \phi_i\rangle|(1+3mM),$$

Proof. Set

$$h' = \mathrm{Proj}_{\mathrm{span}(\phi_1,\dots,\phi_n)}(h).$$

It's clear that

$$\langle h, \phi_i \rangle = \langle h', \phi_i \rangle, \ 1 \le i \le n.$$

Thus the lemma follows from inequality (5) for h'. □

For $n \ge 1$ we define

$$d_n := \langle f_{n-1}, g_n \rangle. \tag{6}$$

Let numbers $x_{i,n}$, $n \ge 1$, $1 \le i \le n$, satisfy the equality

$$f_n = f_{n-1} - \sum_{i=1}^{n} x_{i,n} g_i. \tag{7}$$

Lemma 3. *For any $n \le 2m$ we have*

$$|x_{i,n}| \le M|d_n|(1 + 3mM), \ 1 \le i \le n-1, \tag{8}$$

$$|x_{n,n} - d_n| \le M|d_n|(1 + 3mM). \tag{9}$$

Proof. By definition of OGA

$$\langle f_l, g_i \rangle = 0, \ 1 \le i \le l, \tag{10}$$

and

$$f_n = f - G_n^{OGA}(f, \mathcal{D}) = f - \mathrm{Proj}_{\mathrm{span}(g_1,\dots,g_n)}(f).$$

Hence

$$f_n = f_{n-1} - \mathrm{Proj}_{\mathrm{span}(g_1,\dots,g_n)}(f_{n-1}) = f_{n-1} - d_n g_n - \mathrm{Proj}_{\mathrm{span}(g_1,\dots,g_n)}(f_{n-1} - d_n g_n). \tag{11}$$

Using (1) and (10) we have for $h := f_{n-1} - d_n g_n$ and $1 \le i \le n-1$

$$|\langle h, g_i \rangle| \le |\langle f_{n-1}, g_i \rangle| + |d_n \langle g_i, g_n \rangle| \le M|d_n|,$$

$$\langle h, g_n \rangle = 0.$$

Suppose that $x'_{i,n}$, $1 \le i \le n$ satisfy

$$\mathrm{Proj}_{\mathrm{span}(g_1,\dots,g_n)}(f_{n-1} - d_n g_n) = \mathrm{Proj}_{\mathrm{span}(g_1,\dots,g_n)}(h) = \sum_{i=1}^{n} x'_{i,n} g_i.$$

By Lemma 2

$$|x'_{i,n}| \le M|d_n|(1 + 3mM), \ 1 \le i \le n \tag{12}$$

It follows from (11) that

$$f_n = f_{n-1} - d_n g_n - \sum_{i=1}^{n} x'_{i,n} g_i = f_{n-1} - \sum_{i=1}^{n} x_{i,n} g_i,$$

where $x_{i,n} = x'_{i,n}$, $1 \le i \le n-1$ and $x_{n,n} = d_n + x'_{n,n}$. This and (12) complete the proof. □

Lemma 4. *For* $1 \le n \le 2m-1$ *we have*

$$|d_{n+1}| \le |d_n|(1+1.25M).$$

Proof. By definition of OGA

$$|\langle f_{n-1}, g_{n+1}\rangle| \le |\langle f_{n-1}, g_n\rangle| = |d_n|,$$

Using Lemma 3, (1) and (2) we have

$$|\langle f_n, g_{n+1}\rangle| \le |\langle f_{n-1} - \sum_{i=1}^{n} x_{i,n} g_i, g_{n+1}\rangle| \le |\langle f_{n-1}, g_{n+1}\rangle| + \sum_{i=1}^{n} |x_{i,n}\langle g_i, g_{n+1}\rangle| \le$$

$$\le |d_n| + M\left(|x_{n,n}| + \sum_{i=1}^{n-1} |x_{i,n}|\right) \le |d_n| + (nM|d_n|(1+3mM) + |d_n|)M \le$$

$$\le |d_n|\left(1 + (2mM(1+3mM)+1)M\right) \le |d_n|(1+1.25M).$$

□

Lemma 5. *For any* $1 \le l \le n \le 2m$ *we have*

$$|d_n| \le |d_l| \exp(2.5mM).$$

Proof. Using Lemma 4 we write

$$|d_n| \le |d_l|(1+1.25M)^{n-l} \le |d_l|\left(1 + \frac{2.5mM}{2m}\right)^{2m} \le |d_l|\exp(2.5mM).$$

□

3 Notations.

By the definition of the best m-term approximation there exist $a_j \in \mathbb{R}$, $\psi_j \in \mathcal{D}$, $1 \le j \le m$, and $v_0 \in H$ such that

$$f = f_0 = \sum_{j=1}^{m} a_j \psi_j + v_0, \quad \langle v_0, \psi_j\rangle = 0, \ 1 \le j \le m, \tag{13}$$

$$\|v_0\| \le 1.01\sigma_m(f). \tag{14}$$

Set

$$L := \operatorname{span}(\psi_1, \dots, \psi_m), \quad P_L(\cdot) := \operatorname{Proj}_L(\cdot), \quad P_L^{\perp}(\cdot) := \operatorname{Proj}_{L^{\perp}}(\cdot),$$
$$v_n := P_L^{\perp}(f_n), \ 0 \le n \le 2m.$$

Let numbers $a_{j,n}$ and $b_{j,n}$, $0 \le n \le 2m$, $1 \le j \le m$ satisfy equalities

$$f_n = P_L(f_n) + P_L^{\perp}(f_n) = \sum_{j=1}^{m} a_{j,n}\psi_j + v_n. \tag{15}$$

$$\sum_{j=1}^{m} b_{j,n}\psi_j = P_L(f_0 - f_n). \tag{16}$$

Then

$$a_{j,n} = a_j - b_{j,n},\ 1 \le j \le m,\ 1 \le n \le 2m. \tag{17}$$

Define

$$T_1 := \left\{ i \in \{1,\dots,2m\} :\ g_i \in \{\psi_j\}_{j=1}^{m} \right\}.$$

$$T_2 := \{1,\dots,2m\} \setminus T_1,$$

$$S_1 := \left\{ j \in \{1,\dots,m\} :\ \psi_j \in \{g_n\}_{n=1}^{2m} \right\}, \tag{18}$$

$$S_2 := \{1,\dots,m\} \setminus S_1. \tag{19}$$

For numbers $x_{i,n}$, $1 \le i \le n \le 2m$, from (7) and for d_n from (6) we define

$$x_n := \sum_{1\le i\le n,\ i\in T_2} |x_{i,n}|,$$

$$D := \sum_{1\le n\le 2m,\ n\in T_2} d_n^2.$$

4 Main lemmas.

Lemma 6. *Let $1 \le i < n \le 2m$, $i, n \in T_2$. Then we have*

$$|\langle P_L^{\perp}(g_n), g_i\rangle| \le 1.1M$$

Proof. Let

$$P_L(g_n) = \sum_{j=1}^{m} c_j\psi_j.$$

Since $n \in T_2$ and

$$g_n \ne \psi_j, \quad |\langle g_n, \psi_j\rangle| \le M, \quad 1 \le j \le m,$$

we get by Lemma 2 that

$$\max_{1\le j\le m} |c_j| \le M(1 + 3mM).$$

Therefore we have

$$|\langle P_L^{\perp}(g_n), g_i\rangle| = |\langle g_n - P_L(g_n), g_i\rangle| \le |\langle g_n, g_i\rangle| + |\langle P_L(g_n), g_i\rangle| \le$$

$$\le M + |\langle \sum_{j=1}^{m} c_j\psi_j, g_i\rangle| \le M + m\left(\max_{1\le j\le m}|c_j|\right)\max_{1\le j\le m}|\langle\psi_j, g_i\rangle| \le$$

$$\le M + (mM)M(1 + 3mM) \le 1.1M.$$

□

Lemma 7. *Let $n \in T_1$ then*

$$x_n \le 0.1 D^{1/2} m^{-1/2},$$

$$\|v_n\|^2 \le \|v_{n-1}\|^2 + 0.3DM.$$

Proof. Let

$$u_n := \sharp \left(T_2 \cap \{1, \ldots, n\} \right).$$

If $T_2 \cap \{1, \ldots, n\} = \emptyset$ then $x_n = 0$, $v_n = v_{n-1} = v_0$ and nothing to prove, so we may assume that $u_n \ge 1$. By Lemma 5

$$|d_n| \le \exp(2.5mM) \min_{1 \le i \le n,\ i \in T_2} |d_i|. \tag{20}$$

On the other hand we have

$$\left(\min_{1 \le i \le n,\ i \in T_2} |d_i| \right)^2 u_n \le \sum_{1 \le i \le n,\ i \in T_2} d_i^2 \le \sum_{1 \le i \le 2m,\ i \in T_2} d_i^2 = D.$$

Combining with (20) we obtain

$$|d_n| \le \exp(2.5mM) \left(\frac{D}{u_n} \right)^{1/2}. \tag{21}$$

$$d_n^2 u_n \le \exp(5mM) D. \tag{22}$$

Applying Lemma 3, (2) and (21) we write

$$\begin{aligned} x_n = \sum_{1 \le i \le n,\ i \in T_2} |x_{i,n}| = \sum_{1 \le i \le n-1,\ i \in T_2} |x_{i,n}| \le M |d_n| (1 + 3mM) u_n \le \\ \le M(1 + 3mM) \exp(2.5mM) (D u_n)^{1/2} \le M(1 + 3mM) \exp(2.5mM)(D2m)^{1/2} = \\ = (2D)^{1/2} M m^{1/2} (1 + 3mM) \exp(2.5mM) \le 0.1 D^{1/2} m^{-1/2}. \end{aligned} \tag{23}$$

We have that for any l, $1 \le l \le m$ we have

$$|\langle \sum_{j=1}^{m} a_{j,n-1} \psi_j, \psi_l \rangle| = |\langle \sum_{j=1}^{m} a_{j,n-1} \psi_j + v_{n-1}, \psi_l \rangle| \le |\langle f_{n-1}, \psi_l \rangle| \le |d_n|.$$

Then by Lemma 1 we get

$$\max_{1 \le j \le m} |a_{j,n-1}| \le \left(\max_{1 \le l \le m} |\langle \sum_{j=1}^{m} a_{j,n-1} \psi_j, \psi_l \rangle| \right) (1 + 3mM) \le |d_n| (1 + 3mM). \tag{24}$$

Define

$$h := \sum_{1 \le i \le n, i \in T_2} x_{i,n} g_i = \sum_{1 \le i \le n-1, i \in T_2} x_{i,n} g_i. \tag{25}$$

According the definition of v_n we have

$$v_n = P_L^{\perp}(f_n) = P_L^{\perp} \left(f_{n-1} - \sum_{i=1}^{n} x_{i,n} g_i \right) = v_{n-1} - P_L^{\perp}(h),$$

$$\|v_n\|^2 = \|v_{n-1} - P_L^\perp(h)\|^2 \leq \|v_{n-1}\|^2 + 2|\langle v_{n-1}, P_L^\perp(h)\rangle| + \|P_L^\perp(h)\|^2 \leq$$
$$\leq \|v_{n-1}\|^2 + 2|\langle v_{n-1}, h\rangle| + \|h\|^2. \quad (26)$$

By definition of OGA $\langle f_{n-1}, g_i\rangle = 0$, $1 \leq i \leq n-1$, therefore using (25) and (15)

$$\langle f_{n-1}, h\rangle = 0,$$

$$|\langle v_{n-1}, h\rangle| = |\langle f_{n-1} - \sum_{j=1}^m a_{j,n-1}\psi_j, h\rangle| = \sum_{j=1}^m |\langle a_{j,n-1}\psi_i, h\rangle| \leq$$
$$\leq \sum_{j=1}^m |a_{j,n-1}| \sum_{1\leq i\leq n-1,\ i\in T_2} |\langle \psi_j, x_{i,n}g_i\rangle|.$$

Applying (1), (22), (24) and Lemma 3 we obtain

$$|\langle v_{n-1}, h\rangle| \leq \sum_{j=1}^m |a_{j,n-1}| \sum_{1\leq i\leq n-1,\ i\in T_2} |x_{i,n}\langle \psi_j, g_i\rangle| \leq$$
$$\leq |d_n|(1+3mM)M|d_n|(1+3mM)u_n mM \leq$$
$$\leq (d_n^2 u_n)(1+3mM)^2 mM^2 \leq D\exp(5mM)(1+3mM)^2 mM^2.$$

$$\|h\|^2 = \sum_{1\leq i\leq n,\ i\in T_2} x_{i,n}^2\langle g_i, g_i\rangle + 2\sum_{1\leq i,l\leq n,\ i,l\in T_2,\ i\neq l} x_{i,n}x_{l,n}\langle g_i, g_l\rangle \leq$$
$$\leq M^2|d_n|^2(1+3mM)^2 u_n + 2M^2|d_n|^2(1+3mM)^2 u_n^2 M \leq$$
$$\leq M^2|d_n|^2 u_n(1+3mM)^2 + M^2|d_n|^2 u_n(1+3mM)^2 4mM \leq$$
$$\leq DM^2\exp(5mM)(1+3mM)^2(1+4mM).$$

From (26) and (2) it follows that

$$\|v_n\|^2 \leq \|v_{n-1}\|^2 + 2|\langle v_{n-1}, h\rangle| + \|h\|^2 \leq$$
$$\leq \|v_{n-1}\|^2 + DM\exp(5mM)(1+3mM)^2(2mM + M + 4mM^2) \leq$$
$$\leq \|v_{n-1}\|^2 + DM\exp(5mM)(1+3mM)^2(3mM + 4(mM)^2) \leq \|v_{n-1}\|^2 + 0.3DM.$$

This estimate together with (23) proves the lemma. □

Lemma 8. *Let $n \in T_2$ then*

$$x_n \leq 1.15|d_n|,$$
$$\|v_n\|^2 \leq \|v_{n-1}\|^2 - 0.6d_n^2$$

Proof. Applying Lemma 3 we have

$$x_n = \sum_{1\leq i\leq n,\ i\in T_2} |x_{i,n}| \leq d_n + \sum_{1\leq i\leq n,\ i\in T_2} M|d_n|(1+3mM) \leq$$
$$\leq |d_n|(1 + 2mM(1+3mM)) \leq |d_n|(1+3mM) \leq 1.15|d_n|.$$

By Lemma 1 we have

$$\max_{1\le j\le m}|a_{j,n-1}|\le(1+3mM)\max_{1\le l\le m}\left|\langle\sum_{j=1}^m a_{j,n-1}\psi_j,\psi_l\rangle\right|=$$
$$=(1+3mM)\max_{1\le l\le m}\left|\langle\sum_{j=1}^m a_{j,n-1}\psi_j+v_{n-1},\psi_l\rangle\right|=$$
$$=(1+3mM)\max_{1\le l\le m}|\langle f_{n-1},\psi_l\rangle|\le(1+3mM)|d_n|. \quad (27)$$

Therefore

$$|\langle v_{n-1},g_n\rangle-d_n|=\left|\langle f_{n-1}-\sum_{j=1}^m a_{j,n-1}\psi_j,g_n\rangle-d_n\right|=$$
$$=\left|\langle f_{n-1},g_n\rangle-\sum_{j=1}^m a_{j,n-1}\langle\psi_j,g_n\rangle-d_n\right|\le\left|\sum_{j=1}^m a_{j,n-1}\langle\psi_j,g_n\rangle\right|\le$$
$$\le\left(\max_{1\le j\le m}|a_{j,n-1}|\right)m\max_{1\le j\le m}|\langle\psi_j,g_n\rangle|\le(1+3mM)|d_n|mM. \quad (28)$$

Set

$$v'_n:=P_L^\perp(f_{n-1}-x_{n,n}g_n).$$

Using Lemma 3, (2) and (28) we estimate

$$2x_{n,n}\langle v_{n-1},g_n\rangle=2(d_n+(x_{n,n}-d_n))(d_n+(\langle v_{n-1},g_n\rangle-d_n))\ge$$
$$\ge2(|d_n|-M(1+3mM)|d_n|)(|d_n|-(1+3mM)|d_n|mM)\ge$$
$$\ge2d_n^2-2|d_n|^2(1+3mM)(M+mM)\ge2d_n^2-4|d_n|^2(1+3mM)mM,$$

$$\|v'_n\|^2\le\|P_L^\perp(f_{n-1}-x_{n,n}g_n)\|^2=\|v_{n-1}-x_{n,n}P_L^\perp(g_n)\|^2\le$$
$$\le\|v_{n-1}\|^2-2x_{n,n}\langle v_{n-1},P_L^\perp(g_n)\rangle+x_{n,n}^2\|P_L^\perp(g_n)\|^2\le$$
$$\le\|v_{n-1}\|^2-2x_{n,n}\langle v_{n-1},g_n\rangle+x_{n,n}^2\le$$
$$\le\|v_{n-1}\|^2-2d_n^2+4|d_n|^2(1+3mM)mM+(|d_n|+M|d_n|(1+3mM))^2\le$$
$$\le\|v_{n-1}\|^2-0.65d_n^2. \quad (29)$$

Similar to the proof of Lemma 7 we define

$$h:=\sum_{1\le i\le n-1,i\in T_2}x_{i,n}g_i.$$

Equalities $\langle f_{n-1},g_i\rangle=0$, $1\le i\le n-1$ imply that

$$\langle f_{n-1},h\rangle=0.$$

Using (15) we have

$$|\langle v_n', h\rangle| = |\langle P_L^{\perp}(f_{n-1}) - x_{n,n}P_L^{\perp}(g_n), h\rangle| = |\langle v_{n-1} - x_{n,n}P_L^{\perp}(g_n), h\rangle| =$$
$$= |\langle f_{n-1} - \sum_{j=1}^{m} a_{j,n-1}\psi_j - x_{n,n}P_L^{\perp}(g_n), h\rangle| \le \sum_{j=1}^{m} |\langle a_{j,n-1}\psi_i, h\rangle| + |x_{n,n}\langle P_L^{\perp}(g_n), h\rangle| \le$$
$$\le \sum_{j=1}^{m} |a_{j,n-1}| \sum_{1\le i\le n-1,\ i\in T_2} |\langle \psi_j, x_{i,n}g_i\rangle| + \sum_{1\le i\le n-1,\ i\in T_2} |x_{n,n}x_{i,n}\langle P_L^{\perp}(g_n), g_i\rangle|.$$

Applying (1), (27), Lemma 3 and Lemma 6 we continue

$$|\langle v_n', h\rangle| \le \sum_{j=1}^{m} |a_{j,n-1}| \sum_{1\le i\le n-1,\ i\in T_2} |x_{i,n}||\langle \psi_j, g_i\rangle| + \sum_{1\le i\le n-1,\ i\in T_2} |x_{n,n}x_{i,n}\langle P_L^{\perp}(g_n), g_i\rangle| \le$$
$$\le \max_{1\le j\le m} |a_{j,n-1}| \max_{1\le i\le n-1,\ i\in T_2} |x_{i,n}| \sum_{j=1}^{m} \sum_{1\le i\le n-1,\ i\in T_2} M+$$
$$+ |d_n|(1+M(1+3mM)) \max_{1\le i\le n-1,\ i\in T_2} |x_{i,n}| \sum_{1\le i\le n-1,\ i\in T_2} 1.1M \le$$
$$\le d_n^2(1+3mM)^2 nmM^2 + 1.1d_n^2(1+M(1+3mM))(1+3mM)nM^2 \le$$
$$\le d_n^2(1.15)^2 2(mM)^2 + 1.1d_n^2(1+mM(1.15))(1.15)2mM^2 \le 0.014d_n^2, \quad (30)$$

$$\|h\|^2 = \sum_{1\le i\le n-1,\ i\in T_2} x_{i,n}^2\langle g_i, g_i\rangle + 2\sum_{1\le i,l\le n-1,\ i,l\in T_2,\ i\ne l} x_{i,n}x_{l,n}\langle g_i, g_l\rangle \le$$
$$\le M^2|d_n|^2(1+3mM)^2 n + 2M^2|d_n|^2(1+3mM)^2 n^2 M \le$$
$$\le d_n^2(1+3mM)^2 M(2Mm + 8(Mm)^2) \le 0.008d_n^2. \quad (31)$$

Using definitions of v_n' and h we write

$$v_n = P_L^{\perp}(f_n) = P_L^{\perp}\left(f_{n-1} - \sum_{i=1}^{n} x_{i,n}g_i\right) = P_L^{\perp}(f_{n-1} - x_{n,n}g_n) - P_L^{\perp}\left(\sum_{i=1}^{n-1} x_{i,n}g_i\right) =$$
$$= v_n' - P_L^{\perp}\left(\sum_{1\le i\le n-1,\ i\in T_2} x_{i,n}g_i\right) = v_n' - P_L^{\perp}(h),$$

$$\|v_n\|^2 = \|v_n'\|^2 - 2\langle v_n', P_L^{\perp}(h)\rangle + \|P_L^{\perp}(h)\|^2 \le \|v_n'\|^2 + 2|\langle v_n', h\rangle| + \|h\|^2.$$

Applying (29), (30) and (31) we obtain

$$\|v_n\|^2 \le \|v_n'\|^2 + 2|\langle v_n', P_L^{\perp}(h)\rangle| + \|h\|^2 \le$$
$$\le \|v_{n-1}\|^2 - 0.65d_n^2 + 2(0.014d_n^2) + 0.008d_n^2 \le \|v_{n-1}\|^2 - 0.6d_n^2$$

□

Lemma 9. *We have*

$$\sum_{n=1}^{2m} x_n \leq 2D^{1/2}m^{1/2}.$$

Proof. Using Cauchy inequality, Lemma 8 and Lemma 7 we get

$$\sum_{1\leq n\leq 2m,\ n\in T_2} x_n \leq \sum_{1\leq n\leq 2m,\ n\in T_2} 1.15|d_n| \leq$$

$$\leq 1.15\left(\sum_{1\leq n\leq 2m,\ n\in T_2} d_n^2\right)^{1/2}(2m)^{1/2} \leq 1.7D^{1/2}m^{1/2},$$

$$\sum_{n=1}^{2m} x_l = \sum_{1\leq n\leq 2m,\ n\in T_1} x_n + \sum_{1\leq n\leq 2m,\ n\in T_2} x_n \leq \sharp T_1 \max_{1\leq n\leq 2m,\ n\in T_1} x_n + \sum_{1\leq n\leq 2m,\ n\in T_2} x_n \leq$$

$$\leq m(0.1D^{1/2}m^{-1/2}) + 1.7D^{1/2}m^{1/2} \leq 2D^{1/2}m^{1/2}.$$

□

Lemma 10. *We have*

$$D^{1/2} \leq 1.33\sigma_m(f),$$

$$\|v_{2m}\| \leq \|v_0\|.$$

Proof. Applying (14), Lemma 7 and Lemma 8 we write

$$(1.01\sigma_m(f))^2 \geq \|v_0\|^2 \geq \|v_0\|^2 - \|v_{2m}\|^2 = \sum_{n=1}^{2m}(\|v_{n-1}\|^2 - \|v_n\|^2) =$$

$$= \sum_{1\leq n\leq 2m,\ n\in T_1}(\|v_{n-1}\|^2 - \|v_n\|^2) + \sum_{1\leq n\leq 2m,\ n\in T_2}(\|v_{n-1}\|^2 - \|v_n\|^2) \geq$$

$$\geq \sharp T_1\,(-0.3DM) + \sum_{1\leq n\leq 2m,\ n\in T_2} 0.6d_n^2 \geq m(-0.3DM) + 0.6D \geq 0.58D.$$

Hence

$$D^{1/2} \leq 1.01(0.58)^{-1/2}\sigma_m(f) \leq 1.33\sigma_m(f).$$

□

In the next lemma we use definitions (16), (18) and (19).

Lemma 11. *For any* $1 \leq n \leq 2m$ *and* $j \in S_2$

$$|b_{j,n}| \leq 0.12D^{1/2}m^{-1/2}.$$

Proof. By definition (7)

$$f_n - f_0 = \sum_{l=1}^{n} \sum_{i=1}^{l} x_{i,l} g_i = \sum_{i=1}^{n} g_i \left(\sum_{l=i}^{n} x_{i,l} \right) =$$

$$= \sum_{1 \le i \le n,\ i \in T_1} g_i \left(\sum_{l=i}^{n} x_{i,l} \right) + \sum_{1 \le i \le n,\ i \in T_2} g_i \left(\sum_{l=i}^{n} x_{i,l} \right).$$

Assume that numbers $\widehat{b}_{j,n}$ and $\widetilde{b}_{j,n}$, $1 \le j \le m$, $1 \le n \le 2m$ satisfy

$$\sum_{j=1}^{m} \widehat{b}_{j,n} \psi_j = P_L \left(\sum_{1 \le i \le n,\ i \in T_1} g_i \left(\sum_{l=i}^{n} x_{i,l} \right) \right),$$

$$\sum_{j=1}^{m} \widetilde{b}_{j,n} \psi_j = P_L \left(\sum_{1 \le i \le n,\ i \in T_2} g_i \left(\sum_{l=i}^{n} x_{i,l} \right) \right).$$

It follows from (16) that

$$b_{j,n} = \widehat{b}_{j,n} + \widetilde{b}_{j,n},\ 1 \le j \le m,\ 1 \le n \le 2m. \tag{32}$$

It's clear that

$$P_L \left(\sum_{1 \le i \le n,\ i \in T_1} g_i \left(\sum_{l=i}^{n} x_{i,l} \right) \right) = \sum_{1 \le i \le n,\ i \in T_1} g_i \left(\sum_{l=i}^{n} x_{i,l} \right)$$

and therefore

$$\widehat{b}_{j,n} = 0,\ j \in S_2,\ 1 \le n \le 2m. \tag{33}$$

Set

$$h = \sum_{1 \le i \le n,\ i \in T_2} g_i \left(\sum_{l=i}^{n} x_{i,l} \right).$$

By Lemma 9 we estimate for each j, $1 \le j \le m$,

$$|\langle h, \psi_j \rangle| \le \sum_{1 \le i \le n,\ i \in T_2} \langle g_i, \psi_j \rangle \left(\sum_{l=i}^{n} |x_{i,l}| \right) \le$$

$$\le M \sum_{l=1}^{n} \sum_{1 \le i \le l,\ i \in T_2} |x_{i,l}| \le M \sum_{l=1}^{n} x_l \le M \sum_{l=1}^{2m} x_l \le 2D^{1/2} m^{1/2} M.$$

According Lemma 2 we have for $1 \le j \le m$ and $1 \le n \le 2m$

$$|\widetilde{b}_{j,n}| \le 2D^{1/2} m^{1/2} M (1 + 3mM). \tag{34}$$

Combining (2), (32), (33) and (34) we obtain

$$|b_{j,n}| \le 2D^{1/2} m^{1/2} M (1 + 3mM) \le 0.12 D^{1/2} m^{-1/2},\ j \in S_2,\ 1 \le n \le 2m.$$

□

5 Proof of Theorem 1.

First we estimate $|a_{j,2m}|$, $j \in S_2$. For each $1 \le n \le 2m$ by Lemma 1 and Lemma 11 we have

$$|d_n| \ge \max_{1\le j\le m} |\langle f_{n-1}, \psi_j\rangle| = \max_{1\le j\le m} |\langle P_L(f_{n-1}), \psi_j\rangle| \ge (1-2mM) \max_{1\le j\le m} |a_{j,n-1}| \ge$$
$$\ge (1-2mM) \max_{j\in S_2} |a_{j,n-1}| \ge (1-2mM) \max_{j\in S_2} |a_j - b_{j,n-1}| \ge$$
$$\ge (1-2mM) \left(\max_{j\in S_2} |a_j| - 0.12 D^{1/2} m^{-1/2} \right).$$

Since $\sharp T_1 \le m$ and $\sharp T_2 \ge m$ we get

$$D = \sum_{1\le i\le 2m,\ i\in T_2} d_n^2 \ge m \left((1-2mM) \left(\max_{j\in S_2} |a_j| - 0.12 D^{1/2} m^{-1/2} \right) \right)^2 .$$

Hence

$$\left(\max_{j\in S_2} |a_j| - 0.12 D^{1/2} m^{-1/2} \right) \le D^{1/2} m^{-1/2} (1+3mM),$$
$$\max_{j\in S_2} |a_j| \le 1.15 D^{1/2} m^{-1/2} + 0.12 D^{1/2} m^{-1/2} = 1.27 D^{1/2} m^{-1/2}.$$

Then by (17) and Lemma 11 for any $j \in S_2$ we obtain

$$|a_{j,2m}| = |a_j - b_{j,2m}| \le 1.27 D^{1/2} m^{-1/2} + 0.12 D^{1/2} m^{-1/2} \le 1.4 D^{1/2} m^{-1/2}.$$

We use well known inequality (see, for example, Lemma 2.1 from [2])

$$\left\| \sum_{j\in S_2} a_{j,2m} \psi_j \right\|^2 \le \left(\sum_{j\in S_2} a_{j,2m}^2 \right) (1+mM) \le m \left(1.4 D^{1/2} m^{-1/2} \right)^2 (1.05) \le 2.06 D.$$

Using the definition of OGA, (15), Lemma 10 and (14) we estimate

$$\|f_{2m}\| = \min_{c_i,\ 1\le i\le 2m} \|f_{2m} - \sum_{i=1}^{2m} c_i g_i\| = \min_{c_i,\ 1\le i\le 2m} \| \sum_{j=1}^{m} a_{j,2m}\psi_j + v_{2m} - \sum_{i=1}^{2m} c_i g_i\| \le$$
$$\le \min_{c_i,\ 1\le i\le 2m} \| \sum_{j=1}^{m} a_{j,2m}\psi_j - \sum_{i=1}^{2m} c_i g_i\| + \|v_{2m}\| \le$$
$$\le \min_{c_l,\ l\in S_1} \| \sum_{j=1}^{m} a_{j,2m}\psi_j - \sum_{l\in S_1} c_l \psi_l\| + \|v_0\| \le \left\| \sum_{j\in S_2} a_{j,2m}\psi_j \right\| + \|v_0\| \le$$
$$\le (2.06D)^{1/2} + 1.01\sigma_m(f) \le (2.06)^{1/2} 1.33 \sigma_m(f) + 1.01\sigma_m(f) \le 3\sigma_m(f).$$

This completes the proof. □

The author is grateful professor V.N. Temlyakov and professor S.V. Konyagin for useful discussions.

References

[1] Donoho D. L., Elad M., Temlyakov V. N. " Stable recovey of sparse overcomplete representations in the presense of noise" //*IEEE Trans. Inform. Th.* 2006. V. 52:1. P. 6–18.

[2] Donoho D. L., Elad M., Temlyakov V. N. " On Lebesgue-type inequalities for greedy approximation " //*Journal of Approximation Theory* 2007. V. 147:2. P. 185–195.

[3] Gilbert A.C., Muthukrishnan M., Strauss J. "Approximation of functions over redundant dictionaries using coherence" //*Proc. 14th Annu. ACM-SIAM Symp. Discrete Algorithms.* 2003. P. 243-252.

[4] Gribonval R., Nielsen M. " On the strong uniqueness of highly sparse expansions from redundant dictionaries" // *Proc. Int Conf. Independent Component Anal. (ICA'04)* 2004.

[5] Livshits E.D. "On Greedy Algorithms with bounded cumulative coherence." // http://arxiv.org/abs/0911.1500

[6] Temlyakov V.N., Zheltov P. "On performance of greedy algorithms" // 2010.

[7] Tropp J. A. "Greed is good: algorithmic results for sparse approximation" //*IEEE Trans. Inform. Th.* 2004. V. 50:10. P. 2231–2242.